# Random Subspaces of a Tensor Product and the Additivity Problem 

Ion Nechita

CNRS, Université de Toulouse \& TU München
joint work with
Benoit Collins (Lyon, Ottawa) and Serban Belinschi (Saskatoon)
Saarbrücken, September 18th 2012

## Eigen- and singular values

- Singular value decomposition of a matrix $X \in \mathcal{M}_{k \times n}(\mathbb{C})$

$$
X=\sum \sqrt{\lambda_{i}(X)} e_{i} \otimes f_{i}^{*}
$$

where $e_{i}, f_{i}$ are orthonormal families in $\mathbb{C}^{k}, \mathbb{C}^{n}$, and $\lambda_{1}(X) \geq \lambda_{2}(X) \geq \cdots \geq 0$ are the singular values of $X$.

- The eigenvalues of the matrix $X X^{*}$ are $\lambda_{i}(x)$.
- Question: What are the singular values of a random matrix ?


## Singular values of random matrices, $k$ fixed, $n \rightarrow \infty$ regime

- Let $X$ be a $k \times n$ Ginibre random matrix, i.e. $\left\{X_{i j}\right\}$ are i.i.d. complex Gaussian random variables.
- We are interested in long matrices: $k$ fixed, $n \rightarrow \infty$.
- We normalize our matrices, by taking them on the unit Euclidean sphere $\operatorname{Tr} X X^{*}=1$.
- Thus, the singular values vector $\lambda(X)$ is a probability vector

$$
\lambda(X) \in \Delta_{k}^{\downarrow}=\left\{y \in \mathbb{R}^{k}: y_{i} \geq 0, \sum_{i} y_{i}=1, y_{1} \geq \cdots \geq y_{k}\right\}
$$

- It is an easy exercise to show that, almost surely,

$$
\forall i, \quad \lambda_{i}(X) \rightarrow 1 / k
$$

## Vector formulation

- Recall: SVD of $X \in \mathcal{M}_{k \times n}(\mathbb{C})$

$$
X=\sum \sqrt{\lambda_{i}(X)} e_{i} \otimes f_{i}^{*}
$$

- Using the isomorphism $\mathbb{C}^{k} \otimes C^{n} \simeq \mathcal{M}_{k \times n}(\mathbb{C}), X$ can be seen as a vector in a tensor product $x \in \mathbb{C}^{k} \otimes \mathbb{C}^{n}$.
- The vector $x$ admits a Schmidt decomposition $x=\sum_{i} \sqrt{\lambda_{i}(x)} e_{i} \otimes f_{i}$.
- The eigenvalues of the matrix $X X^{*}=\left[\mathrm{id}_{k} \otimes \operatorname{Tr}_{n}\right] P_{x}$ are $\lambda_{i}(x)$.
- Problem: What are the singular values of ALL vectors [matrices] inside a (random) subspace $V$ of a tensor product [matrix space] ?
- This is a simple question about subspaces of tensor products (equivalently, about the singular values of matrices inside a given subspace $V$ ).


## Singular values of vectors from a subspace

- For a subspace $V \subset \mathbb{C}^{k} \otimes \mathbb{C}^{n}$ of dimension $d$, define the set eigen-/singular values or Schmidt coefficients

$$
K_{V}=\{\lambda(x): x \in V,\|x\|=1\} .
$$

- Our goal is to understand $K_{V}$.
- The set $K_{V}$ is a compact subset of the ordered probability simplex $\Delta_{k}^{\downarrow}$.
- Local invariance: $K_{\left(U_{1} \otimes U_{2}\right) V}=K_{V}$, for unitary matrices $U_{1} \in \mathcal{U}(k)$ and $U_{2} \in \mathcal{U}(n)$.
- Monotonicity: if $V_{1} \subset V_{2}$, then $K_{V_{1}} \subset K_{V_{2}}$.
- Example: $d=1, V=\mathbb{C} x$. We have $K_{V}=\{\lambda(x)\}$.
- Example: if $d>(k-1) n$, then $(1,0, \ldots, 0) \in K_{V}$.


## Examples

- $: V=\operatorname{span}\left\{G_{1}, G_{2}\right\}$, where $G_{1,2}$ are $3 \times 3$ independent Ginibre random matrices.



## Examples

- $: V=\operatorname{span}\left\{G_{1}, G_{2}\right\}$, where $G_{1,2}$ are $3 \times 3$ independent Ginibre random matrices.



## Examples

- : $V=\operatorname{span}\left\{\mathrm{I}_{3}, G\right\}$, where $G$ is a $3 \times 3$ Ginibre random matrix.



## Examples

- : $V=\operatorname{span}\left\{\mathrm{I}_{3}, G\right\}$, where $G$ is a $3 \times 3$ Ginibre random matrix.



## Why do we care ? Quantum channels!

- Quantum states with $d$ degrees of freedom are described by density matrices

$$
X \in \mathcal{M}^{\text {sa }}\left(\mathbb{C}^{d}\right) ; \quad \operatorname{Tr} X=1 \text { and } X \geq 0
$$

- Quantum channels $\mathcal{N}: \mathcal{M}\left(\mathbb{C}^{d}\right) \rightarrow \mathcal{M}\left(\mathbb{C}^{k}\right)$ are completely positive, trace-preserving maps. In particular, they send quantum states to quantum states.
- Complete positivity $\mathrm{CP}: \mathcal{N} \otimes \mathrm{id}_{n}$ preserves positivity.
- Trace preservation TP: $\operatorname{Tr}[\mathcal{N}(X)]=\operatorname{Tr}(X)$ for all $X$.
- Quantum channels describe the most general physical transformations a quantum system can undergo.


## Additivity of minimum p-Rényi entropies

- The von Neumann entropy of $X \in \mathcal{M}^{1,+}\left(\mathbb{C}^{d}\right)$

$$
H(X)=-\operatorname{Tr}(X \log X)
$$

- The entropy is additive: $H\left(X_{1} \otimes X_{2}\right)=H\left(X_{1}\right)+H\left(X_{2}\right)$.
- The minimum output entropy of a quantum channel is

$$
H^{\min }(\mathcal{N})=\min _{X \in \mathcal{M}^{1,+}\left(\mathbb{C}^{d}\right)} H(\mathcal{N}(X)) .
$$

Conjecture (Amosov, Holevo, and Werner '00)
For any channels $\mathcal{N}_{1}, \mathcal{N}_{2}$

$$
H^{\min }\left(\mathcal{N}_{1} \otimes \mathcal{N}_{2}\right)=H^{\min }\left(\mathcal{N}_{1}\right)+H^{\min }\left(\mathcal{N}_{2}\right)
$$

- Given $\mathcal{N}_{1}, \mathcal{N}_{2}$, the $\leq$ direction of the equality is trivial, take $X_{12}=X_{1} \otimes X_{2}$.
- But ... the Additivity Conjecture is false! [Hayden, Winter '08, Hastings '09]


## Random channels and random subspaces

- Consider an isometry $W: \mathbb{C}^{d} \rightarrow \mathbb{C}^{k} \otimes \mathbb{C}^{n}$ and let $V$ be its image $\operatorname{Im} W=V$ so that $V \subset \mathbb{C}^{k} \otimes \mathbb{C}^{n}$ is a subspace of dimension $d$.
- One can define a channel $\mathcal{N}: \mathcal{M}\left(\mathbb{C}^{d}\right) \rightarrow \mathcal{M}\left(\mathbb{C}^{k}\right)$ by $\mathcal{N}(X)=\left[\mathrm{id}_{\mathrm{k}} \otimes \operatorname{Tr}_{\mathrm{n}}\right]\left(W X W^{*}\right)$.
- Every channel can be defined in this way (by choosing $n$ large enough).
- By convexity properties, the MOE is attained on pure states i.e. rank one projectors.
- Since $\mathcal{N}\left(P_{x}\right)=\left[\mathrm{id}_{\mathrm{k}} \otimes \operatorname{Tr}_{\mathrm{n}}\right]\left(W P_{x} W^{*}\right)=\left[\mathrm{id}_{k} \otimes \operatorname{Tr}_{n}\right] P_{W_{x}}$, the minimal entropies of the channel $\mathcal{N}$ are determined by the image subspace $V=\operatorname{Im} W$.
- There is an uniform (or Haar) measure on the set of $d$-dimensional subspaces of $\mathbb{C}^{k n}$.
- Take a $k n \times k n$ Haar distributed random unitary matrix $U \in \mathcal{U}(k n)$ and take $V$ to be the span of its first $d$ columns.


## Main result

- For the rest of the talk, we consider the following asymptotic regime: $k$ fixed, $n \rightarrow \infty$, and $d \sim t k n$, for a fixed parameter $t \in(0,1)$.


## Theorem (Belinschi, Collins, N. '10)

For a sequence of uniformly distributed random subspaces $V_{n}$, the set $K_{V_{n}}$ of singular values of unit vectors from $V_{n}$ converges (almost surely, in the Hausdorff distance) to a deterministic convex subset $K_{k, t}$ of the probability simplex $\Delta_{k}$

$$
K_{k, t}:=\left\{\lambda \in \Delta_{k} \mid \forall x \in \Delta_{k},\langle\lambda, x\rangle \leq\|x\|_{(t)}\right\} .
$$

## The $t$-norm

## Definition

For a positive integer $k$, embed $\mathbb{R}^{k}$ as a self-adjoint real subalgebra $\mathcal{R}$ of a $\mathrm{II}_{1}$ factor $(\mathcal{A}, \tau)$, so that $\tau(x)=\left(x_{1}+\cdots+x_{k}\right) / k$. Let $p_{t}$ be a projection of rank $t \in(0,1]$ in $\mathcal{A}$, free from $\mathcal{R}$. On the real vector space $\mathbb{R}^{k}$, we introduce the following norm, called the ( $t$ )-norm:

$$
\|x\|_{(t)}:=\left\|p_{t} x p_{t}\right\|_{\infty}
$$

where the vector $x \in \mathbb{R}^{k}$ is identified with its image in $\mathcal{R}$.

## Proposition

The distribution $\mu_{t^{-1} p_{t} \times p_{t}}$ of the (non-commutative) random variable $t^{-1} p_{t} \times p_{t}$ in the $\mathrm{I}_{1}$ factor reduced by the projection $p_{t}$ is $\mu_{t^{-1} p_{t} \times p_{t}}=\mu_{x}^{\boxplus 1 / t}, \quad t \in(0,1]$, where $\boxplus$ denotes the free additive convolution of Voiculescu.

## Corollary: exact limit of the MOE

- By the previous theorem, in the specific asymptotic regime $t, k$ fixed, $n \rightarrow \infty, d \sim t k n$, we have the following a.s. convergence result for random quantum channels:

$$
\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} H^{\min }(\mathcal{N})=\min _{\lambda \in K_{k, t}} H(\lambda) .
$$

- It is not just a bound, the exact limit value is obtained $)^{-}$
- However, the set $K_{k, t}$ is not explicit, and minimizing entropy functions is difficult $:+$


## Idea of the proof

- Question: what is the maximum singular value $\max _{x \in V,\|x\|=1} \lambda_{1}(x)$ of a unit vector from $V$ ?
- Compute

$$
\begin{aligned}
\max _{x \in V,\|x\|=1} \lambda_{1}(x) & =\max _{x \in V,\|x\|=1} \lambda_{1}\left(\left[\mathrm{id}_{k} \otimes \operatorname{Tr}_{n}\right] P_{x}\right) \\
& =\max _{x \in V,\|x\|=1}\left\|\left[\mathrm{id}_{k} \otimes \operatorname{Tr}_{n}\right] P_{x}\right\| \\
& =\max _{x \in V,\|x\|=1} \max _{y \in \mathbb{C}^{k},\|y\|=1} \operatorname{Tr}\left[\left(\left[\mathrm{id}_{k} \otimes \operatorname{Tr}_{n}\right] P_{x}\right) \cdot P_{y}\right] \\
& =\max _{x \in V,\|x\|=1} \max _{y \in \mathbb{C}^{k},\|y\|=1} \operatorname{Tr}\left[P_{x} \cdot P_{y} \otimes \mathrm{I}_{n}\right] \\
& =\max _{y \in \mathbb{C}^{k},\|y\|=1} \max _{x \in V,\|x\|=1} \operatorname{Tr}\left[P_{x} \cdot P_{y} \otimes \mathrm{I}_{n}\right] \\
& =\max _{y \in \mathbb{C}^{k},\|y\|=1}\left\|P_{V} \cdot P_{y} \otimes \mathrm{I}_{n}\right\|_{\infty} .
\end{aligned}
$$

- Limit of $\left\|P_{V} \cdot P_{y} \otimes \mathrm{I}_{n}\right\|_{\infty}$ for fixed $y$ and random $V$ ?


## Theorem (Collins '05)

In $\mathbb{C}^{n}$, choose at random according to the Haar measure two independent subspaces $V_{n}$ and $V_{n}^{\prime}$ of respective dimensions $q_{n} \sim \alpha n$ and $q_{n}^{\prime} \sim \beta n$ where $\alpha, \beta \in(0,1)$. Let $P_{n}\left(r e s p . P_{n}^{\prime}\right)$ be the orthogonal projection onto $V_{n}$ (resp. $V_{n}^{\prime}$ ). Then,

$$
\lim _{n}\left\|P_{n} P_{n}^{\prime} P_{n}\right\|_{\infty}=\varphi(\alpha, \beta) .
$$

- One can compute $\varphi(\alpha, \beta)=\alpha+\beta-2 \alpha \beta+2 \sqrt{\alpha \beta(1-\alpha)(1-\beta)}$ if $\alpha+\beta \leq 1$ and $\varphi(\alpha, \beta)=1$ if $\alpha+\beta>1$ (subspaces $V_{n}$ and $V_{n}^{\prime}$ have non-trivial intersection).


## The set $K_{k, t}$ and $t$-norms

- $K_{k, t}:=\left\{\lambda \in \Delta_{k} \mid \forall x \in \Delta_{k},\langle\lambda, x\rangle \leq\|x\|_{(t)}\right\}$.
- Recall that

$$
\max _{x \in V,\|x\|=1} \lambda_{1}(x)=\max _{y \in \mathbb{C}^{k},\|y\|=1}\left\|P_{V} P_{y} \otimes \mathrm{I}_{n}\right\|_{\infty} .
$$

- For fixed $y, P_{V}$ and $P_{y} \otimes \mathrm{I}_{n}$ are independent projectors of relative ranks $t$ and $1 / k$ respectively.
- Thus, $\left\|P_{V} \cdot P_{y} \otimes \mathrm{I}_{n}\right\|_{\infty} \rightarrow \varphi(t, 1 / k)=\|(1,0, \ldots, 0)\|_{(t)}$.
- We can take the max over $y$ at no cost, by considering a finite net of $y$ 's, since $k$ is fixed.
- To get the full result, use $\langle\lambda, x\rangle$ (for all directions $x$ ) instead of $\lambda_{1}$.
- Unfortunately, it is difficult to compute ( $t$ )-norms, so we do not have an explicit formula for $K_{k, t}$.


## Thank you!

Collins, N. - Random quantum channels II: Entanglement of random subspaces, Rényi entropy estimates and additivity problems.

Belinschi, Collins, N. - Laws of large numbers for eigenvectors and eigenvalues associated to random subspaces in a tensor product.

